

m

STATE EMPLOYMENT
RELATIONS BOARD

FEB 4 11 17 AM '97

STATUTORY DISPUTE RESOLUTION PROCEEDINGS
STATE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS BOARD
ADMINISTRATOR FACT FINDING REPORT

In the Matter Between:)
)
TEAMSTERS LOCAL 20)
The Union,)
)
-and-)
)
OTTAWA COUNTY)
COMMISSIONERS)
The Employer)

SERB Case No.
96-MED-09-0711

REPRESENTING THE TEAMSTERS
Ms. Beth Lee

Business Representative
IBT #20

REPRESENTING THE COUNTY
Ms. Ruth A. Dyke

County Human Resource Director

BACKGROUND

Teamsters Local #20 is the bargaining representative for all full-time and regular part-time non-supervisory, non-confidential, and non-management employees in the building inspection and the sanitary engineers departments of Ottawa County, Ohio. There are 23 employees in the unit represented by the Teamsters Local #20. The current collective bargaining agreement expired December 7, 1996. The parties met with a mediator in an attempt to resolve outstanding issues. Both parties were aware that the factfinder would rely upon criteria listed in Rule 4117-9-05 (J) of the State Employment Relations Board.

The parties were unable to reach agreement on four issues which included:

ARTICLE 19 - EDUCATIONAL REIMBURSEMENT

ARTICLE 44 - SECTION #5 AND #6, SHIFT PREMIUM PAY

ARTICLE 48 - LONGEVITY PAY

ARTICLE 39 - WAGES

UNRESOLVED ISSUES AND POSITIONS

The management has proposed that:

Class 1 Water Distribution be raised to **\$0.25** per hour

Class 2 Wastewater Collection be raised to **\$0.25** per hour

Class 2 Water Distribution be raised to **\$0.50** per hour

Class 2 Wastewater Collection be raised to **\$0.50** per hour

In addition, the management has proposed that the class 1, 11, 111 Operator license be raised as follows:

Class 1 Operator - **\$0.10** per hour

Class 11 Operator - **\$0.15** per hour

Class 111 Operator - **\$0.20** per hour
(Not cumulative, higher rate
supersedes lower rate)

The Union has proposed in Section 5:

Water Distribution rate be raised to **\$0.40** per hour

Wastewater Collection rate be raised to **\$0.40** per hour

Class 2 Water Distribution rate be raised to **\$0.80** per hour

Class 2 Wastewater Collection rate be raised to **\$0.80** per hour

Class 1 Operator	\$0.20
Class 11 Operator	\$0.30
Class 111 Operator	\$0.40

The proposed increases that the city has suggested represent a fair increase for bonus pay over the last contract. Therefore, the factfinder will recommend that the city proposal be adopted with minor revisions.

ARTICLE 44 - HOURS OF WORK AND WORK WEEK

Under the managements' last proposal, Sections 1 through 4 would remain unchanged. The Ottawa County Commissioners have proposed that workers on the second shift shall receive **\$0.25** per hour in addition to their base hourly wage. Employees working on the third shift shall receive **\$0.30** per hour in addition to their base hourly wage.

The union's last proposal also states that Sections 1 through 4 should remain unchanged. However, the union proposed that second shift workers shall receive **\$0.40** per hour in addition to their base hourly age. Employees working on the third shift shall receive **\$0.60** per hour in addition to their base hourly wage.

At present there is no third shift.o The proposed increase in salary would have an impact upon only second shift workers. The management proposal represents a fair increase over the previous contract provision. A review of comparables supports the fairness of the management proposal. Thus, the management proposal will be recommended by the factfinder.

ARTICLE 48 - LONGEVITY PAY

Management has proposed that current contract language be retained. The union has proposed that the longevity pay be increased in the following manner:

<u>Calendar Years of Continuous Service</u>	<u>Percent of Annual Base Salary</u>
After 5 years	1.0%
After 10 years	1.5%
After 15 years	2.0%
After 20 years	2.5%

A review of comparables reveals that a number of similarly situated workers have no longevity pay or a base that is similar to the present contract provision. The factfinder will recommend that present contract language be retained.

ARTICLE 39 - WAGES

Management has proposed that a three (3) percent average increase be provided for each position over the first, second and third year of the contract. This would result in an increase equal to \$0.38 for each position during the first year of the contract, \$0.39 for the second year of the contract and \$0.41 for the third year of the contract.

The union has proposed that a 4 1/2 % increase for all positions be granted for EACH of the three years of the contract. In addition, the union proposes that the base pay be increased for the following positions:

Maintenance 11	13.87
Maintenance 1	10.04
Operator Maintenance	14.28
Principal Clerk 11	11.61
Billing Specialist/Clerical 11	11.61
Bookkeeper 11	11.61

Principal Clerk 1	10.84
Billing Specialist/Clerical 1	10.84
Bookkeeper 1	10.84
Full-Time Secretary	9.78
Part-Time Secretary	8.30

A review of the comparables presented by management and union representatives suggest that some increase in base rate pay would be fair. Comparables and testimony given at the hearing suggest differences concerning the change in selected positions base pay are not warranted. The factfinder will recommend an increase in basic wages and a continuation of the present position/classification base pay.

RECOMMENDATIONS

**Article 19
Educational Reimbursement**

Section 1 through 4.
Unchanged

Section 5. Upon completion of the following licenses, the County agrees to pay an hourly bonus to employees who are currently working in a job classification where distribution or collection licensing will directly benefit the county or serve to enhance operations. This bonus only applies to Maintenance Workers 1 and 11.

Class 1 Water Distribution	\$0.25 per hour
Class 2 Wastewater Collection	\$0.25 per hour
Class 2 Water Distribution	\$0.50 per hour
Class 2 Wastewater Collection	\$0.50 per hour

The \$0.50 per hour bonus for a Class 2 license is a maximum bonus amount paid for obtaining the license. It is not paid in addition to the \$0.25 per hour. Class 1 license bonus amount (assuming the employee has also secured the Class 1 license).

The class 1, 11, and 111 Operator license applies only to Maintenance Workers 1 and 11.

Class 1 Operator	\$0.10 per hour
Class 11 Operator	\$0.15 per hour
Class 111 Operator	\$0.20 per hour
	(Not cumulative, higher rate supersedes lower rate)

Section 6
Unchanged

**ARTICLE 44
HOURS OF WORK AND WORK WEEK**

Section 1 through 4
Unchanged

Section 5. Employees working on a second shift shall receive **twenty-five (\$.25)** per hour in addition to their base hourly wage. This shift difference shall be paid only for hours worked. The second shift shall be considered to be any employee who starts four (4) to eight (8) hours after the regularly scheduled start of the first shift.

Section 6. Employees working on a third shift shall receive **sixty cents (\$.60)** per hour in addition to their base hourly wage. This shift difference shall be paid only for hours worked. The second shift shall be considered to be any employee who starts four (4) hours to eight (8) hours after the regularly scheduled start of the second shift.

**ARTICLE 48
LONGEVITY PAY**

Section 1. Regular employees of the County shall be entitled to be paid longevity in accordance with the following formula:

<u>Calendar Years of Continuous Service</u>	<u>Percent of Annual Base Salary</u>
After 5 years	0.5 %
After 10 years	1.0%
After 15 years	1.5%
After 20 years	1.0%

The longevity payment shall be made in a separate check to be distributed to the employees on the first payday in December of the year for which the payment is being made (beginning 1991).

**ARTICLE 39
WAGES
YEAR 1 (1208096 THROUGH 12-7-97)**

POSITION/CLASSIFICATION	HIRE RATE	4 MONTHS AFTER HIRE	15 MONTHS AFTER HIRE	27 MONTHS AFTER HIRE
Building Inspector				
Electrical Inspector				
Maintenance Foreman				
Operator 111/Maintenance				
Electrical Maintenance				
Operator 11/Maintenance				
Lab Tech				
Inspector				
Operator 1 Maintenance				
Maintenance Worker 11				
Bookkeeper/Clerical 11				
Principal Clerk 11				
Bookkeeper/Clerical 1				
Billing/Clerical Specialist 11				
Principal Clerk 1				
Billing/Clerical Specialist 1				
Full-Time Secretary/Typist				
Maintenance Worker 1				
Part-Time Secretary/Typist				

**3 1/2 % increase in the base
for each position/classification**

YEAR 2 (12-8-97 Through 12-7-98)

There shall be a 3 1/2% increase in the base for each position/classification.

YEAR 3 (12-8-98 Through 12-9-99)

There shall be a 3 1/2% increase in the base for each position/classification.

FACTFINDER'S CONCLUSION

In the Fact Finder's opinion the foregoing recommendations provide for fair and equitable resolution of the impasse. In the event that any of the recommendations fail to meeting the tentative agreement established between the parties it is noted that Ohio Revised Code 4117.14 (C)(b) permits corrections and modifications by mutual agreement of the parties.

CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE

This is to certify that the foregoing Fact Finder Report Case Number 96-MED-09-0711 was sent by overnight U.S. Postal Service mail to: Ms. Ruth Dyke, 315 Madison St., Port Clinton, Ohio 43452 for the employer, Ms. Beth Lee, Business Representative, Teamsters Local #20, 435 S. Hawley Street, Toledo, Ohio 43609 for the union, and G Thomas Worley, Director Bureau of Mediation SERB 65 East State St., Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213 on this third day of February, 1997.



Daniel L. Merritt

Fact Finder

088326963