

STATE-EMPLOYMENT
RELATIONS BOARD
DEC 22 10 08 AM '95

STATE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS BOARD
95 - MED - 09 - 0706
706

CITY OF ALLIANCE) FACT-FINDING REPORT
)
And) STANLEY B. WIENER,
) FACT FINDER
)
FRATERNAL ORDER OF POLICE)
OHIO LABOR COUNCIL, INC.) DECEMBER 20, 1995
(DISPATCHERS)

oOo

A fact-finding hearing was held on December 15, 1995 at the City Of Alliance Police Station, 470 E. Market Street, Alliance, Ohio 44601, before STANLEY B. WIENER, Fact Finder.

Representing the City Of Alliance ("City") was ROBERT J. TSCHOLL, Esq. Also appearing on behalf of the City was JAMES R. BLACK, Chief of the City Police Department, and ANDREI A. DORDEA, City Auditor.

Representing the FRATERNAL ORDER OF POLICE ("Union") was OTTO J. HOLM, Jr., Staff Representative. Also appearing on behalf of the Union was Patrolmen DIANE OAKS, Dispatcher. The Bargaining Unit consists of approximately eight (8) Dispatchers.

I. PAST NEGOTIATIONS

This is the first contract between the City and the Dispatchers. The parties met in September and October, 1995, and agreed upon the entire contract except for wages. It is a one year contract effective January 1, 1996.

III. ISSUES AT IMPASSE

A. EQUITY ADJUSTMENT TO BASE WAGE RATES

UNION: The Hourly base wage rates effective January 1, 1996 should be as follows:

Dispatchers	4	(Entry Level	\$ 8.49
Dispatchers	3		9.06
Dispatchers	2		9.62
Dispatchers	1		10.19

CITY: No change in hourly base wage rates. Current entry level rate of \$6.49 and top level rate of \$8.19 should not be changed.

B. PAY INCREASE

UNION: Pay increase of \$.50 per hour effective January 1, 1996 so that the hourly wage rates for 1996 shall be:

Dispatchers	4	(Entry Level)	\$ 8.99
Dispatchers	3		9.56
Dispatchers	2		10.12
Dispatchers	1		10.69

CITY: Three percent (3%) increase to current base wage rate (approximately \$.25 per hour).

IV. POSITIONS, FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

I am required as Fact-Finder to take into consideration certain factors including but not limited to, past contracts, if any, between the parties, comparison of issues with employees doing comparable work in other cities, the interests and welfare of the

public, and the financial ability of the employer. I have done this with the issues discussed below.

The Union introduced many exhibits comparing the wage rates of the City Dispatchers with the wage rates of cities considered comparable to Alliance. The City introduced exhibits reflecting its financial position. I appreciate the extensive work, preparation and research of the parties..

A. EQUITY ADJUSTMENT TO BASE WAGE RATES:

UNION POSITION: The Dispatchers of Alliance receive approximately Three and 00/100 dollars (\$3.00) to Three and 50/100 dollars (\$3.50) per hour less than Dispatchers in comparable jurisdictions, such as North Canton, Kent, Perry Township and Louisville. Even Sebring with about one-sixth (1/6) of the population of Alliance pays more. In Alliance the Dispatchers work for both the Police and Fire Departments. Extensive duties have been added to their work load. The calls handled by the Alliance Dispatchers, exceed the calls of the comparable cities. The average salary of the Dispatchers is substantially less than the average salary of the Clerks and Typists employed by the City. If the entire equity adjustment requested (Two and 00/100 dollars (\$2.00) per hour) was granted, the City Dispatchers would still receive less than those in comparable jurisdictions.

CITY POSITION: Alliance is not a wealthy city. Finances prevent any equitable adjustment to be made, let alone the high adjustments requested by the Union. Economic factors such as annual income tax receipts and assessed valuations of real property have been fairly constant for the past four (4) or five (5) years.

FINDING: Alliance is a city of approximately

25,000 people. The Dispatchers handle calls for both the Police and Fire Departments, as well as calls for the Smith Township Police and for Mount Union College. So far this year the Dispatchers received in excess of 13,000 calls. The hourly rate is FAR below that received by Dispatchers of comparable cities. (See exhibit "A", attached hereto and made a part hereof). The current top rate is Eight and 19/100 dollars (\$8.19) per hour, and the entry rate is Six and 49/100 dollars (\$6.49) per hour. The entry levels of all the jurisdictions listed on Exhibit "A" exceed the Alliance top level. The current rates in Alliance have been in existence for two (2) years. The average hourly rate for Alliance Dispatchers is eighty one cents (\$.81) less than the average hourly rate of all office clerks. ANDREI A. DORDEA, the City Auditor presented substantial evidence of the City's financial condition. There is no question that the City's economy has been quite stagnant for the past several years. However, for each of the past seven (7) years the City has had a surplus. For example, in 1994 the ending balance was a plus \$432,000.00. The balance for 1995 is estimated to be higher. Income tax receipts for 1994 was \$5,746,569.00; income tax receipts for 1995 is estimated at \$6.2 million dollars.

Great reliance is placed upon Dispatchers. Initial contacts to the Safety Departments are made through the Dispatchers. I am certain that the citizens of Alliance would rest more comfortably knowing that the City can maintain a well-trained and reasonably compensated unit of Dispatchers.

My recommendations below will still leave Alliance Dispatchers behind, but there is only so much that one can do in a one year contract.

RECOMMENDATION: Effective January 1, 1996 the basic hourly wage levels (prior to wage increase discussed in (B) below) shall be:

Dispatcher 4 (Entry Level)	\$ 7.70
----------------------------	---------

Dispatchers 3	8.27
Dispatchers 2	8.83
Dispatchers 1	9.40

B. **WAGE INCREASE:**

UNION POSITION: A fifty cent (\$.50) per hour wage increase will still make total compensation for this Union less than comparable units.

CITY POSITION: Twenty-Five cents (\$.25) per hour . For position see "City Position" set forth in Paragraph A above.

FINDING: Taking into consideration the current increases given to Police employees in Ohio, I believe an increase of thirty eight cents (\$.38) per hour would be reasonable. (Four percent (4%) of the top wage level).

RECOMMENDATION: Effective January 1, 1996, an increase of thirty-eight cents (\$.38) per hour to be added to each of the basic hourly wage levels set forth in the recommendation immediately above.

SUMMARY: Combining both recommendations, effective January 1, 1996 the hourly wages for Alliance Dispatchers shall be:

Dispatcher 4 (Entry Level)	\$ 8.08
Dispatchers 3	8.65
Dispatchers 2	9.21
Dispatchers 1	9.78

NOTE: For the record, at the hearing mention was made by the Union for extra pay for those Dispatchers who train others. No discussion was had. In any event I would have not recommended

training pay at this time. This being a one year contract I assume this issue will again be raised and discussed in depth.

Respectfully submitted,

DATED:

12/20/95


STANLEY B. WIENER
Fact Finder

SERVICE

True copies of the foregoing Report were sent this 20th day of December, 1995, to each of the following:

By Federal Express to:

Robert J. Tscholl, Esq.
740 United Bank Building
Canton, Ohio 44702-2181

By hand delivery to:

Otto J. Holm, Jr.
48 Triskett Road
West Park, Ohio 44111



STANLEY B. WIENER, Fact-Finder

CITY	POP	UNIT Size	UNIT HR Week	HOURLY RATE		DOLLAR DIFF		PERCENT		AVER Diff	AVE\$DIFF	
				Top	Bottom	Top	Bottom	Top	Bottom		Top	Bottom
Alliance	25,000+	7	40	\$ 8.19	\$ 6.49							
Louisville	8,087	n/a	40	\$10.87	\$10.87	\$2.68	\$4.38	32.72%	67.49%	50.11%	\$2.68	\$4.38
NoCanton	14,748	n/a	40	\$10.92	\$10.05	\$2.73	\$3.56	33.33%	54.85%	44.09%	\$2.73	\$3.56
Red Ctr	n/a	apx 12	40	\$10.95	\$8.47	\$2.76	\$1.98	33.70%	30.51%	32.10%	\$2.76	\$1.98
Kent	30,000+	9	40	\$13.69	\$10.17	\$5.50	\$3.88	67.16%	58.70%	61.93%	\$5.50	\$3.68
Perry Twp	31,000	n/a	40	\$10.23	\$10.23	\$2.04	\$3.74	24.91%	57.63%	41.27%	\$2.04	\$3.74
Austintwn	n/a	n/a	40	\$12.76	\$12.76	\$4.57	\$6.27	55.80%	96.61%	76.20%	\$4.57	\$6.27
Sebring	4,848	n/a	40	\$8.40	\$8.40	\$0.21	\$1.91	2.58%	29.43%	16.00%	\$0.21	\$1.91
SERB	n/a	n/a	40	\$11.71	\$9.41	\$3.52	\$2.92	42.98%	44.99%	43.99%	\$3.52	\$2.92
SUMMARY									54.78%	45.71%	\$ 3.00	\$ 3.56
<p>The summary row of this table shows that the Alliance Dispatchers wages averages \$3.00 less per hour when compared against the top wage-weighted average and \$3.56 less starting wage, shown in the table above.</p>												
<p>In total, the union's proposal brings the Dispatchers' wages within .50 per hour compared to the top scale and within approximately \$1.00 per hour when compared to the starting wage.</p>												

EXHIBIT "A"