

**STATE OF OHIO  
BEFORE THE OHIO STATE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS BOARD**

STATE EMPLOYMENT  
RELATIONS BOARD  
2012 SEP -7 A 11:43

**IN THE MATTER OF FACT FINDING**

**BETWEEN THE CITY OF ZANESVILLE  
AND  
FRATERNAL ORDER OF POLICE/OHIO LABOR COUNCIL, INC  
(Police Secretaries & Records Clerks)**

SERB Case # 11-MED-09-1272

Date of Hearing: August 30, 2012

E. William Lewis, Fact Finder

Fact Findings and Recommendations

Appearances:

Mr. Chuck Choate, Senior Staff Rep.  
Fraternal Order of Police/OLC  
2721 Manchester Road  
Akron, Ohio 44319

Todd M. Ellsworth, Esq.  
Downes Fishel Hass Kim  
400 South Fifth St., Suite 200  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

**AUTHORITY**

In the matter brought before Fact Finder E. William Lewis in keeping with applicable provisions of Ohio Revised Code 4117 and related rules and regulations of the Ohio State Employment Relations Board. The parties have complied in a timely manner with all procedural filings. The matter before the Fact Finder is for consideration and recommendation based on merit and fact according to the provisions of ORC 4117.

In attendance:

For the City:

Mr. Todd Ellsworth	Labor Counsel
Mr. Fred Buck	Safety Director
Ms. Rhonda Heskett	Director, Budget & Finance
Mr. Scott Hillis	Law Director
Mr. Eric Lames	Police Chief

In attendance for the Union:

Mr. Chuck Choate	FOP Representative
Ms. April Roll	Secretary, ZPD
Ms. Tresa Shuster	Police Records Clerk

**BACKGROUND:**

The City of Zanesville, hereinafter known as the Employer/City, provides municipal and safety services to approximately 25,000 citizens. The Fraternal Order of Police, Ohio Labor Council, represents a bargaining unit of six employees. This bargaining unit is one of six bargaining units within the City. The bargaining unit provides non-uniform support services to the certified police officers and administration.

This is a successor Agreement to the Collective Bargaining Agreement that expired on December 31, 2011. The parties have had one bargaining session on May 10, 2012, and resolved all issues except those listed below:

**ARTICLE 23, WAGES**

Section 23.1-SALARIES, WAGES, AND SALARY RANGES(Appendix I)

Section 23.2-AUTOMATIC PAY INCREMENTS

Section 23.3-LONGEVITY PAY

Section 23.4-CALL-IN PAY/COURT PAY

## ARTICLE 25, INSURANCE SCHEDULE

Section 25.1 (B) - Insurance

Section 25.2 (C) - CONTENT OF INSURANCE PLAN

1. Employee Premium Payroll Deductions
2. Employee Deductibles
3. Employee Co-Insurance
4. Employee Out-of-Pocket Maximums

Section 25.2 (D) - CONTENT OF INSURANCE PLAN

1. Co-pays for prescription drugs

Section 25.2 (E) - CONTENT OF INSURANCE PLAN

1. Dental and Vision coverage only

## ARTICLE 28, TRAINING AND EDUCATION

SECTION 28.4 - Maximum reimbursement amounts

SECTION 28.5 - Repayment of Education Reimbursement Monies

Based upon the mutually agreed settlement procedure between the parties, this Fact Finder was appointed by SERB on July 19, 2012. By mutual agreement, the Fact Finding Hearing was scheduled for August 30, 2012.

In accordance with Ohio Revised Code 4117.14(C)(4)(e), in making recommendations, the Fact Finder takes into consideration the following factors:

- (1) Past collectively bargained agreements, if any, between the parties;
- (2) Comparison of the unresolved issues relative to the employees in the bargaining unit with those issues related to other public and private employees doing comparable work, giving consideration to factors peculiar to the area and classification involved;

- (3) The interest and welfare of the public, the ability of the public employer to finance and administer the issues proposed, and the effect of the adjustment on the normal standard of public service;
- (4) The lawful authority of the public employer;
- (5) Any stipulations of the parties;
- (6) Such other factors not confined to those listed above, which are normally or traditionally taken into consideration in the determination of issues submitted to mutually agreed upon dispute settlement procedures in the public service or in private employment.

**THE FACT FINDING HEARING:**

At the Fact Finding Hearing the parties mutually agreed to enter into mediation on the unresolved issues, as encouraged by ORC 4117. During the mediation session with the fact finder, all the unresolved issues were resolved, and signed-off as Tentative Agreements. Therefore, the fact finder's recommendations are the attached signed Tentative Agreements, agreed to before the fact finder at the August 30, 2012 Hearing.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>A'd</u>	<u>Article</u>	
5/10/12	1	Agreement
5/10/12	2	Recognition
5/10/12	3	Labor Council Security
5/10/12	4	Management Rights
5/10/12	5	Joint Cooperation
5/10/12	6	Non-Discrimination
5/10/12	7	Labor Council Representation
5/10/12	8	No Strike/No Lockout
5/10/12	9	Probationary Period
5/10/12	10	Seniority
5/10/12	11	Layoff and Recall
5/10/12	12	Labor/Management Meetings
5/10/12	13	Grievance Procedure
5/10/12	14	Arbitration
5/10/12	15	Personnel Files
5/10/12	16	Rights of Employees
5/10/12	17	Drug/Alcohol Testing
5/10/12	18	Ordinances, Rules and Regulations
5/10/12	<del>19</del>	<del>Residency Requirement</del>
5/10/12	20	19 Reporting for Work
5/10/12	21	20 Working Conditions
5/10/12	22	21 Hours of Work and Overtime
	23	22 Wages
5/10/12	24	23 Vacation
	25	24 Insurance Schedule
5/10/12	26	25 Sick Leave
5/10/12	27	26 Injury Leave
	28	27 Training and Education
5/10/12	29	28 Family and Medical Leave
5/10/12	<del>30</del> 29	<del>29</del> Miscellaneous Economic
5/10/12	30	30 Waiver in Case of Emergency
5/10/12	31	31 Mid-Term Bargaining
	32	32 Duration
		Appendix I



CITY  
TIME 8-30-12  
SM

ARTICLE 23  
WAGES

Section 23.1 Salaries, Wages, and Salary Ranges

- A. The hourly pay rates for the position classifications of Police Secretary and Police Records Clerk shall be in accordance with those set forth in Appendix I. Wages for 2012 shall be effective October ~~1~~<sup>2</sup>, 2012. Wages for 2013-2014, shall be effective the first day of the first full pay period of January.

Section 23.2 Automatic Pay Increments

- A. Pay increments for 2012 shall be effective October ~~1~~<sup>5</sup>, 2012 for those employees eligible for a step increment on January 1, 2012. Step increments in 2013-2014 shall be that upon hire, employees shall be assigned to the lowest step in the proper classification. Each January thereafter employees will receive an increase to the next higher step in their classification.
- B. Pay increases in 2012 shall be effective on October ~~1~~<sup>5</sup>, 2012. Pay increases in 2013 and 2014 shall be effective on the first day of the first full pay period in January.

Section 23.3 Longevity Pay

- A. The City of Zanesville will grant longevity pay each year to permanent full-time employees covered by this Agreement in accordance with the following schedule:

In the years 2012 and ~~2013~~

<u>YEARS OF SERVICE AS OF SEPTEMBER 30</u>	<u>LONGEVITY PAY</u>
5	1% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
9	2% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
13	3% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
16	4% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings

*2013 and 2014*  
In the years ~~2013~~

<u>YEARS OF SERVICE AS OF SEPTEMBER 30</u>	<u>LONGEVITY PAY</u>
5	2% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
9	3% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
13	4% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings
16	5% of Previous Annual Payroll Earnings

- B. Payment is to be calculated on the previous annual payroll earnings.

1  City  
TME 8-30-12  
STM 

- C. September 30 of each year in which the payment is to be made shall be used in calculating years of service for longevity pay.
- D. Payment shall be made in a lump sum during October of each year and shall be separate from the employee's regular paycheck. Longevity pay shall be taxed as if earned over the entire payroll year (26 pay periods).
- E. Employees who are on the payroll as of June 30 will be entitled to a prorated share of their longevity pay even though they may terminate prior to October 1. This shall apply to termination under honorable circumstances. Upon ~~termination under honorable circumstances, employees who are eligible for longevity pay will be paid, as part of their terminal pay, the final partial year's longevity pay on a prorated basis.~~ The prorated pay shall be based on the number of completed pay periods in the final year of service divided by twenty-six (26) and multiplied by the longevity pay due for the entire year.

Section 23.4 Call-In Pay/Court Pay

- A. Call-in pay shall be provided when an employee is required to report for work or to report for scheduled or ordered court appearances at times other than his regular shift or hours of work regardless of whether or not work is available or the court case is actually conducted.
- B. An employee called in under Section A shall receive three (3) hours pay at his base rate (straight time) or pay for time actually worked at the applicable rate whichever is greater.
- C. Call-in pay shall not be provided for: (1) work extending beyond the end of an employee's scheduled shift; (2) work before and continuing into his scheduled shift; ~~(3) scheduled training periods; (4) scheduled departmental meetings;~~ (5) situations in which employees are summoned back to work to correct errors or incomplete task during his assigned duty hours.
- D. Employees who fall under Section C only shall be paid at the applicable hourly rate, except that for scheduled training periods and scheduled department meetings employees shall receive one (1) hour's pay at his base rate (straight time) or pay for time actually worked at the applicable rate, whichever is greater.
- E. "Scheduled" as listed in Section C only shall mean a minimum of 48 hours notice.
- F. An employee may, at his option, receive compensatory time off in lieu of pay for call-in or court appearances.
- G. Call-in time for which payment is rendered shall not be used for computing the forty

*[Handwritten signature]*

CIM  
 TME 8-30-1.  
 S/H RSH

(40) hour work week for premium pay. Any time actually worked under each call-in that exceeds 2 hours shall be used in computing the forty (40) hour week for premium pay. Hours worked as defined in Section 2.3(B) shall be used to compute the forty (40) hours work week for premium pay.

Section 23.5 Hazardous Weather

The City, at its sole discretion, shall determine when hazardous weather conditions exist. If City Hall is closed by the Mayor due to hazardous weather conditions or the police chief or his designee deem the weather too hazardous for travel, members of this unit shall not be required to report to work and shall be compensated for all the hours of the regular shift the employee was scheduled to work but did not work due to such closing.

*[Handwritten signature]*

City  
TME 8-30-12  
SDI ~~RSK~~

ARTICLE 25  
INSURANCE SCHEDULE

Section 25.1 Insurance

- A. ~~During the term of this contract, The City of Zanesville shall continue its premium payment for the existing provide a health, dental, and vision insurance plan for the employee and qualified dependents. , except employees choosing single coverage shall pay by payroll deduction \$20.00 per pay period. Bargaining unit employees choosing family coverage shall pay by payroll deduction \$45.00 per pay period. Rates for 2011 shall be the stated rate or the rate charged to unaffiliated employees, whichever is less.~~
- B. Effective January 1, 2013, if the spouse of a City employee is employed and is eligible for employer-sponsored health coverage with said employer, he or she must enroll in that particular health plan. If the spouse cannot obtain coverage through his or her employer until a certain date or open enrollment period, the spouse will be covered under the City's plan until he or she can obtain coverage through his or her employer. The spouse must provide documentation to the City that he or she is not eligible for coverage. Employees whose spouse has health insurance coverage through an employer are eligible for up to a \$1,200 reimbursement or an amount in reduced insurance premium payroll deduction up to the \$1,200 reimbursement to offset the cost increase to the employee. If an employee's spouse would be required to pay more than 50% of the insurance premium through their employer, he or she would be allowed to remain on the City's plan. Spouses may also remain on the City's plan under secondary coverage.

Section 25.2 Content of Insurance Plan

- A. ~~The City of Zanesville may periodically change the content of the insurance plan after consultation with representatives of the affected bargaining units. The purpose of changing the content of the plan shall be to either improve the coverage provided and/or reduce the premiums without substantially reducing the benefit levels. Reasonable adjustment of deductibles to compensate for inflation shall not be construed as a reduction in benefit levels. Deductibles for family coverage shall be \$350.00. Deductibles for single coverage shall be \$150.00. Copay under the prescription drug plan shall be \$10.00. The plan will not pay for a brand drug unless no generic is available or the prescribing physician specifies "no generic."~~
- B. The City shall establish an employees health care committee comprised of the Budget and Finance director and one representative each from the City unions and one unaffiliated representative. When necessary or desirable, this committee shall explore alternate health care plans, cost saving measures, and proposed changes to current coverage before changes are proposed pursuant to paragraph (A) of this



CITY  
TME 8-30-12  
SBI RSB

section.

A. Employee cost sharing under the basic medical and major medical sections of the health plan shall be as follows:

1. For the years 2012 and 2013, the employee payroll deduction for health coverage shall not exceed 7½% of the fully funded rates provided to the City by the plan's third party administrator at the annual plan renewal. For 2012 the deduction each pay period shall be \$22.45 for single coverage and \$52.70 for family coverage which shall be effective October 5~~4~~ 2012. The annual increase/adjustment in 2013 may not exceed 10% of the previous year's deduction. For the year 2014, the payroll deduction for health coverage shall not exceed 10% of the fully funded rates nor what the 2013 payroll deduction would have been if the agreed to percentage of funding rates had been 10% in 2013. Deductions in 2013 and 2014 shall be effective the first day of the first full pay period in January.
2. The annual in-network deductible shall be \$200 per individual and \$500 per family. The annual out-of-network deductible shall be \$400 per individual and \$1,000 per family.
3. The in-network co-insurance shall be 90%. The out-of-network co-insurance shall be 70%. If in-network options are not available, the out-of-network co-insurance shall be 90%.
4. The annual in-network out-of-pocket maximum shall be \$800 per individual, including deductible. The annual in-network out-of-pocket maximum shall be \$2,000 per family, including deductible. The annual out-of-network out-of-pocket maximum shall be \$1,600 per individual, including deductible. The annual out-of-network out-of-pocket maximum shall be \$4,000 per family, including deductible.

B. Co-pays under the prescription plan shall be determined as follows:

	<u>2012</u>	<u>2013</u>	<u>2014</u>
Retail:	Tier 1 = \$5 Tier 2 = \$20 Tier 3 = 20% of claim	Tier 1 = \$5 Tier 2 = \$25 Tier 3 = 25% of claim	Tier 1 = \$5 Tier 2 = \$30 Tier 3 = 30% of claim
Mail Order:	Tier 1 = \$10 Tier 2 = \$40 Tier 3 = 20% of claim	Tier 1 = \$10 Tier 2 = \$50 Tier 3 = 25% of claim	Tier 1 = \$10 Tier 2 = \$60 Tier 3 = 30% of claim



CIM  
ME 8-30-12  
SJM

The Tier 2 co-pay shall be used for a Tier 3 drug that has no Tier 1 or Tier 2 equivalent. Tier 3 drugs are capped at \$100 per prescription.

- C. The payroll deduction for employees choosing only dental and/or vision coverage shall be \$3.00 for dental, \$1.50 for vision or \$4.50 for dental and vision per pay period.

Section 25.3 Changes in Insurance Status

Employees must report any family, marital, or Medicare status changes, which affect their health insurance coverage, to the City Auditor immediately following such a change. An employee failing to do so is liable for back payments to the City for additional premiums paid by the City on the employee's behalf.

Section 25.4 Paid Insurance While on Workers' Compensation

While an employee is on workers compensation as a direct result of his employment with the City, the City of Zanesville agrees to continue paying his insurance premiums for up to six months.

Section 25.5 Life Insurance Clause

The City will continue to provide a twenty thousand dollar (\$20,000.00) life insurance policy currently in effect.

Section 25.6 Insurance Grievances

A grievance alleging violation of the terms of this Article shall proceed immediately to Step 3 in the grievance procedure pursuant to Section 13.15. While decisions made by the city's insurance provider while processing claims in accordance with the city's health plan are not grievable, issues involving whether or not the City changed its plan in violation of ~~Section 25.4~~ this Article are grievable.



CITY  
THU 8-30-12  
5:11 PM

ARTICLE 28  
TRAINING AND EDUCATION

Section 28.1 Department Related Training

Employees attending approved training sessions will be reimbursed for meals and other expenses, when authorized. Employees who use their private vehicle to attend approved training sessions will be reimbursed for travel mileage, when authorized. Reimbursements at the current rates established by City Council. Approved training and education related to the Police Department's activities shall be paid for by the City of Zanesville. Employees will be required to take appropriate police-related training or retraining as deemed appropriate by the Police Chief.

Section 28.2 Reimbursement Program

The City shall share tuition reimbursement expenses with employees interested in attaining a higher level of technical or general competence through advanced education in such courses as may be determined by the Chief Executive Employee, upon prior approval, to relate to the employee's job with the City.

Section 28.3 Reimbursement Amount

The City's share of the tuition cost of any approved course shall be based on the passing grade as indicated by the following scale:

<u>GRADE</u>	<u>PERCENT OF REIMBURSEMENT</u>
A	90
B	80
C	65

Section 28.4 Maximum Reimbursement Amounts

The maximum annual tuition reimbursement for all of the members of the bargaining unit shall be for a total of ten thousand dollars (\$10,000). The maximum annual tuition reimbursement for any individual bargaining unit member shall be two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500).



CITY  
TME 8-30-12  
SM 

Section 28.5 Repayment of Education Reimbursement Monies

Employees who resign from employment, for reasons other than a disability retirement, within three (3) years after the receipt of any tuition reimbursement received from the City after October 3, 2012, shall repay such reimbursement to the City.

5



CITY  
TME 8-30-12  
RBR

APPENDIX I

HOURLY RATES FOR POLICE RECORDS CLERKS

<u>Step</u>	<u>2011</u>	<u>2012</u> (0%)	<u>2013</u> (1%)	<u>2014</u> (1%)
1	<del>10.04</del>	10.04	10.14	10.24
2	<del>10.33</del>	10.33	10.43	10.54
3	<del>10.64</del>	10.64	10.75	10.85
4	<del>10.96</del>	10.96	11.07	11.18
5	<del>11.29</del>	11.29	11.40	11.52
6	<del>11.63</del>	11.63	11.75	11.86
7				
8				
9	<del>14.74</del>	14.74	14.89	15.04

<u>2011 Implementation:</u>			
	<u>2010</u> <u>Rate</u>	<u>2011</u> <u>Rate</u>	<u>2012</u> <u>Rate</u>
Shuster	<del>9.56</del>	<del>10.04</del>	10.33
Farmer	<del>9.65</del>	<del>10.33</del>	10.64
Nykite	<del>10.54</del>	<del>11.29</del>	
Pierce			10.33
Brookover	<del>14.17</del>	<del>14.74</del>	14.74

HOURLY PAY RATES FOR POLICE SECRETARIES

<u>Step</u>	<u>2011</u>	<u>2012</u> (0%)	<u>2013</u> (1%)	<u>2014</u> (1%)
1	<del>12.00</del>	12.00	12.12	12.24
2	<del>12.36</del>	12.36	12.48	12.61
3	<del>12.73</del>	12.73	12.86	12.99
4	<del>13.11</del>	13.11	13.24	13.37
5	<del>13.50</del>	13.50	13.64	13.77
6				
7				
8	<del>15.78</del>	15.78	15.94	16.10

<u>2011 Implementation:</u>			
	<u>2010</u> <u>Rate</u>	<u>2011</u> <u>Rate</u>	<u>2012</u> <u>Rate</u>
Salmons	<del>11.88</del>	<del>12.73</del>	13.11
Roll	<del>12.24</del>	<del>13.11</del>	13.50
Highfield	<del>15.17</del>	<del>15.78</del>	

Zanesville/City/POP Secretaries and Clerks Fact Finding 8-30-12 Employer Proposals at Fact Finding



City  
TME 8-30-12  
RSH

## CONCLUSION

The Fact Finder's recommendations are the signed Tentative Agreements contained herein, reached during our mediation discussions. In addition, I also incorporate into this Report, the tentative agreements of the parties reached through negotiations, and the language of the expired Agreement which remains unchanged by the parties.

This concludes the Fact Finding Report.

Respectfully submitted this 6<sup>th</sup> day of September 2012.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "E. William Lewis". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

E. William Lewis  
Fact Finder

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true copy of this Fact Finder's Report was served by regular U.S. mail to Mr. Chuck Choate, Senior staff Representative, FOP/OLC at 2721 Manchester Road, Akron, Ohio 44319, and to Mr. Todd Ellsworth, Esq. Downes Fishel Hass Kim, 400 South Fifth Street, Suite 200, Columbus, Ohio 43215, and to Ms. Mary Laurent, Bureau of Mediation, State Employment Relations Board, 65 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215, this 6th day of September, 2012.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "E. William Lewis". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, sweeping "E" and a long, horizontal flourish at the end.

E. William Lewis  
Fact Finder

